

## Transcript of the Testimony of Morris Hulgan

**Date:** August 25, 2010

Case:

Printed On: September 1, 2010

Sargent's Court Reporting Services, Inc.

Phone: 814-536-8908 Fax: 814-536-4968

Email: schedule@sargents.com

Internet: www.sargents.com

## STATEMENT UNDER OATH

OF

## MORRIS HULGAN

taken pursuant to Notice by Alicia R. Brant, a Court Reporter and Notary Public in and for the State of West Virginia, at The National Mine Health & Safety Academy, 1301 Airport Road, Room C-137, Beaver, West Virginia, on Wednesday, August 25, 2010, beginning at 1:02 p.m.

Any reproduction of this transcript is prohibited without authorization by the certifying agency.

1 APPEARANCES

2

- 3 BARRY KOERBER, ESQUIRE
- 4 West Virginia Office of Miners' Health,
- 5 Safety and Training
- 6 1615 Washington Street East
- 7 Charleston, WV 25311

8

- 9 ROBERT S. WILSON, ESQUIRE
- 10 U.S. Department of Labor
- 11 Office of the Regional Solicitor
- 12 1100 Wilson Boulevard
- 13 22nd Floor West
- 14 Arlington, VA 22209-2247

15

- 16 ERIK SHERER
- 17 Mine Safety and Health Administration
- 18 1100 Wilson Boulevard
- 19 Arlington, VA 22209-3939

20

- 21 CELESTE MONFORTON, MPH, DRPH
- 22 West Virginia Independent Investigation
- 23 2100 M. Street, NW
- 24 Suite 203
- 25 Washington, DC 20037

```
Page 3
 1
              APPEARANCES (cont.)
 2
    TERRY FARLEY
 3
    West Virginia Office of Miners' Health,
 4
 5
    Safety and Training
     1615 Washington Street East
 6
 7
    Charleston, WV 25311
 8
 9
    JOHN O'BRIEN
10
    Safety Inspector
    West Virginia Office of Miners' Health,
11
12
    Safety and Training
    Welch Regional Office
13
    891 Stewart Street
14
    Welch, WV 24801-2311
15
16
    (b) (7)(C) (WIFE)
17
        PERSONAL REPRESENTATIVE
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

|    |                                  | Page 4 |  |  |
|----|----------------------------------|--------|--|--|
| 1  | I N D E X                        |        |  |  |
| 2  |                                  |        |  |  |
| 3  | OPENING STATEMENT                |        |  |  |
| 4  | By Attorney Wilson 7 - 8         | 3      |  |  |
| 5  | DISCUSSION AMONG PARTIES 8 - 10  | )      |  |  |
| 6  | CONTINUED OPENING STATEMENT      |        |  |  |
| 7  | By Attorney Wilson 11 - 13       | 3      |  |  |
| 8  | STATEMENT                        |        |  |  |
| 9  | By Mr. Farley 13 - 14            | 1      |  |  |
| 10 | WITNESS: MORRIS HULGAN           |        |  |  |
| 11 | EXAMINATION                      |        |  |  |
| 12 | By Mr. Sherer 14 - 49            | )      |  |  |
| 13 | EXAMINATION                      |        |  |  |
| 14 | By Mr. Farley 49 - 66            | 5      |  |  |
| 15 | EXAMINATION                      |        |  |  |
| 16 | By Ms. Monforton 66 - 70         | )      |  |  |
| 17 | RE-EXAMINATION                   |        |  |  |
| 18 | By Mr. Sherer 71                 | L      |  |  |
| 19 | CLOSING STATEMENT                |        |  |  |
| 20 | By Attorney Wilson 72            | 2      |  |  |
| 21 | RE-EXAMINATION                   |        |  |  |
| 22 | By Ms. Monforton 73 - 74         | 1      |  |  |
| 23 | DISCUSSION AMONG PARTIES 74 - 76 | 5      |  |  |
| 24 |                                  |        |  |  |
| 25 |                                  |        |  |  |
| l  |                                  |        |  |  |

|    |                   |         | Page 5 |
|----|-------------------|---------|--------|
| 1  | I N D E X (cont.) |         |        |
| 2  |                   |         |        |
| 3  | RE-EXAMINATION    |         |        |
| 4  | By Ms. Monforton  | 76 - 79 |        |
| 5  | RE-EXAMINATION    |         |        |
| 6  | By Mr. Farley     | 79 - 81 |        |
| 7  | CERTIFICATE       | 82      |        |
| 8  |                   |         |        |
| 9  |                   |         |        |
| 10 |                   |         |        |
| 11 |                   |         |        |
| 12 |                   |         |        |
| 13 |                   |         |        |
| 14 |                   |         |        |
| 15 |                   |         |        |
| 16 |                   |         |        |
| 17 |                   |         |        |
| 18 |                   |         |        |
| 19 |                   |         |        |
| 20 |                   |         |        |
| 21 |                   |         |        |
| 22 |                   |         |        |
| 23 |                   |         |        |
| 24 |                   |         |        |
| 25 |                   |         |        |
|    |                   |         |        |

|    |                 |                |            | Page 6 |
|----|-----------------|----------------|------------|--------|
| 1  |                 | EXHIBIT PAGE   |            |        |
| 2  |                 |                | PAGE       |        |
| 3  | NUMBER          | DESCRIPTION    | IDENTIFIED |        |
| 4  | One             | Subpoena       | 10*        |        |
| 5  | Two             | Return receipt | 10*        |        |
| 6  | Three           | Photograph     | 74*        |        |
| 7  | Four            | Photograph     | 74*        |        |
| 8  | Five            | Photograph     | 74*        |        |
| 9  |                 |                |            |        |
| 10 |                 |                |            |        |
| 11 |                 |                |            |        |
| 12 |                 |                |            |        |
| 13 |                 |                |            |        |
| 14 |                 |                |            |        |
| 15 |                 |                |            |        |
| 16 |                 |                |            |        |
| 17 |                 |                |            |        |
| 18 |                 |                |            |        |
| 19 |                 |                |            |        |
| 20 |                 |                |            |        |
| 21 |                 |                |            |        |
| 22 |                 |                |            |        |
| 23 |                 |                |            |        |
| 24 |                 |                |            |        |
| 25 | * Exhibit not a | ttached        |            |        |

- 1 PROCEEDINGS
- 2 ------
- 3 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 4 Good afternoon. My name is Bob Wilson.
- 5 I'm with the Office of the Solicitor, United States
- 6 Department of Labor. Today is August 25th, 2010.
- We're here to conduct an interview of Mr. Morris
- 8 Hulgan. Also present are individuals with the State
- 9 of West Virginia. I'll ask that they identify
- 10 themselves for the record.
- 11 MR. FARLEY:
- 12 I'm Terry Farley, with the West Virginia
- Office of Miners' Health, Safety and Training.
- 14 MR. O'BRIEN:
- 15 John O'Brien, with the West Virginia
- 16 Office of Miners' Health, Safety and Training.
- 17 ATTORNEY KOERBER:
- 18 Barry Koerber. I'm an Assistant Attorney
- 19 General assigned to represent the West Virginia Office
- of Miners' Health, Safety and Training.
- 21 MS. MONFORTON:
- 22 And I'm Celeste Monforton. I'm with the
- 23 Governor's independent team.
- 24 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 25 And also Erik Sherer is an investigator

- with MSHA. Mr. Hulgan, if you would, please face the
- 2 court reporter and she will swear you in.
- 3 -----
- 4 MORRIS HULGAN, HAVING FIRST BEEN DULY SWORN, TESTIFIED
- 5 AS FOLLOWS:
- 6 -----
- 7 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 8 Barry, do you want to address these few?
- 9 ATTORNEY KOERBER:
- 10 Sir, would you please state your full
- 11 name for the record and spell your last name?
- 12 A. Morris W. Hulgan, Jr., and my last name is
- H-U-L-G-A-N.
- 14 ATTORNEY KOERBER:
- 15 And would you please state your address
- and telephone number?
- 17 A. It's (b) (7)(C)
- 18 (b) (7)(C) And the number is --- area code is (b) (7)(C)
- 19 (b) (7)(C)
- 20 ATTORNEY KOERBER:
- 21 And do you have an attorney or other
- 22 personal representative with you here today?
- 23 A. Just (b) (7)(C)
- 24 ATTORNEY KOERBER:
- 25 Ma'am, would you please state your name

- 1 for the record?
- 2 **(b) (7)(C)**
- 3 (b) (7)(C)
- 4 ATTORNEY KOERBER:
- 5 And you're his wife?
- 6 (b) (7)(C)
- 7 Yes.
- 8 ATTORNEY KOERBER:
- 9 Sir, are you appearing here today because
- of being served with a subpoena?
- 11 A. Yes, I am.
- 12 ATTORNEY KOERBER:
- 13 And I'd like to have this marked as
- 14 Exhibit One. This is a copy of that subpoena. And
- 15 you can take a look at it to make sure that you agree
- that it's a copy of the subpoena. And this you have
- 17 not seen. This is the return of service signed by the
- Deputy Sheriff guy that served you, saying that he
- served you on the 19th day of August, at 12:55 p.m.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 ATTORNEY KOERBER:
- 22 And there's attached to it a copy of the
- subpoena, and then he writes up here when he stops out
- there and you're not home. NH means not home.
- 25 Anyway, I'd like to be Exhibit Two.

- 1 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- Okay. Those are marked Exhibit Hulgan
- 3 One and Hulgan Two.
- 4 (M. Hulgan Exhibits One and Two marked
- 5 for identification.)
- 6 ATTORNEY KOERBER:
- 7 Sir, the statute that authorizes the
- 8 Director to issue subpoenas compelling witnesses to
- 9 appear interviews such as this requires the Director
- to offer to these witnesses a \$40 witness fee and
- 11 roundtrip mileage, so long as you drove in your
- personal vehicle, at the rate of 15 cents a mile, plus
- reimbursement for any tolls that you may have passed
- on your way here or back. In order to receive that
- money, I need two forms to be filled out, one of which
- is an IRS Form W-9, which is a request for your Social
- 17 Security number, because the \$40 witness fee is income
- and you --- it will be reported to the IRS and you
- 19 will receive at a later date a 1099 miscellaneous so
- that you can put that with your 2010 taxes. Would you
- 21 like to fill those forms out at the close of this
- interview or would you like to decline?
- A. Decline.
- 24 ATTORNEY KOERBER:
- 25 Okay. Thank you.

## 1 ATTORNEY WILSON:

- 2 Mr. Hulgan, government investigators and
- 3 specialists have been assigned to conduct an
- 4 investigation into the conditions, events and
- 5 circumstances surrounding the April 5th, 2010
- fatalities that occurred at the Upper Big Branch
- 7 Mine-South. The investigation is being conducted by
- 8 MSHA pursuant to Section 103(a) of the Federal Mine
- 9 Safety and Health Act and by the West Virginia Office
- of Miners' Health, Safety and Training. We appreciate
- 11 your appearing here today to answer our questions.
- 12 There are other individuals present in the room with
- either the State of West Virginia or MSHA.
- 14 All members of the Mine Safety and Health
- 15 Administration Accident Investigation Team and all
- 16 members of the State of West Virginia Accident
- 17 Investigation Teams participating in the investigation
- 18 of the Upper Big Branch Mine explosion shall keep
- 19 confidential all information that is gathered from
- 20 each witness who provides a statement until witness
- 21 statements are officially released. MSHA and the
- 22 State of West Virginia shall keep this information
- 23 confidential so as not to jeopardize or prejudice
- 24 other law enforcement activities. This
- 25 confidentiality requirement shall not preclude

- 1 investigators from sharing information with each other
- or with other law enforcement officials. Everyone's
- 3 participation in this interview constitutes their
- 4 agreement to maintain this confidentiality.
- 5 After the investigation is complete, MSHA
- 6 will issue a public report detailing the nature and
- 7 the causes of the fatalities in the hope that greater
- 8 awareness about the causes of accidents can reduce
- 9 their occurrence in the future. Also, at the
- 10 conclusion of the interview process transcripts of all
- of the interviews will be released to the public.
- 12 Information obtained through witness interviews is
- frequently included in the reports that the agencies
- 14 prepare. Your statement may also be used in other
- proceedings. Because we will be interviewing
- 16 additional witnesses, we request that you not discuss
- 17 your testimony with anyone other than with your wife.
- 18 A court reporter will be recording the
- interview, so please speak loudly and clearly so that
- 20 she can take everything down. If you do not
- 21 understand the question, please ask that the question
- 22 be rephrased. Please answer each question as fully as
- 23 you can, including any information that you may have
- learned from someone else. If at any time you need to
- take a break, just let me know and we can go off the

- 1 record.
- 2 After we have finished asking questions,
- 3 we will provide you with an opportunity to add any
- 4 additional information to the record that you believe
- 5 may be important to the investigation. After your
- 6 interview is completed today, if you think of any
- 7 additional information, please contact Norman Page,
- 8 who is MSHA's lead accident investigator, here at the
- 9 Mine Academy. And I'll give you a letter now dated
- 10 August 25th, 2010, verifying your appearance here
- 11 today. And that letter contains contact information
- where you can contact the investigation team here at
- the Mine Academy. Terry?
- 14 MR. FARLEY:
- 15 Mr. Hulgan, on behalf of the Office of
- 16 Miners' Health, Safety and Training, I want to inform
- 17 you that the West Virginia State Mining Regulations,
- particularly the West Virginia Code, Chapter 22A,
- 19 Article One, Section 22, provides protection against
- 20 potential discrimination for participating in these
- 21 type interviews. I'm going to pass along some contact
- information from the West Virginia Board of Appeals.
- 23 That Board hears complaints from miners concerning any
- 24 discrimination problems. And should you experience
- any such problems as a result of participating in this

- 1 investigation and in this interview, please contact
- the Board immediately. I would caution you that
- 3 should you need to file a claim, you need to do it
- 4 within 30 days of when the problem occurs. Thank you.
- 5 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 6 Celeste, did you have anything?
- 7 MS. MONFORTON:
- 8 No.
- 9 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 10 No. Okay. Then Mr. Hulgan, I'm going to
- turn it over to Erik Sherer, who's going to start the
- 12 questions.
- 13 A. Okay.
- 14 EXAMINATION
- 15 BY MR. SHERER:
- 16 Q. Okay. I want to thank you for coming down here
- this afternoon, Mr. Hulgan.
- 18 A. Okay.
- 19 Q. We're doing an investigation into the explosion.
- We're looking for any information that we can possibly
- get that will help us determine what led up to the
- 22 explosion, what caused the explosion. We're doing
- that for two reasons. The first is the families and
- the friends and the coworkers of those miners deserve
- 25 to know what happened.

- 1 A. Absolutely.
- 2 Q. And the second reason is we want to prevent
- 3 similar occurrences in the future. So anything you
- 4 can share with us would be greatly appreciated.
- 5 Roughly, how many years of mining experience do you
- 6 have?
- 7 A. Twenty-seven (27), 28 years.
- 8 Q. Okay. When did you start with the Massey
- 9 organization?
- 10 A. 1999.
- 11 Q. 1999. When did you start working at Upper Big
- 12 Branch?
- 13 A. I probably worked at Upper Big Branch about a year
- 14 before this explosion happened.
- 15 Q. Okay. There had been a couple problems that I ---
- that they had at Upper Big Branch that I left, and
- they put us back over at Slip Ridge. One was when
- 18 they had trouble building this shaft up here, and a
- 19 bit broke. And they put us back over at Slip Ridge
- 20 for about a month or so. Then as soon as they got the
- 21 hole drilled and the spads set, they put us back over,
- 22 you know.
- 23 Q. Okay. And you've been at Upper Big Branch since
- 24 they got the Bandytown fan shaft ---?
- 25 A. Yeah. Actually, I drove all of Headgate 21. I

- 1 mined every bit of Headgate 21 and all this over in
- 2 here.
- 3 Q. Okay.
- 4 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 5 And over in here, you're pointing to the
- 6 north area?
- 7 A. Headgate 22. That's Headgate 22; right?
- 8 BY MR. SHERER:
- 9 Q. No, that's --- this is Headgate 22.
- 10 A. Oh, okay. Okay. Headgate 22, right. Okay. I
- 11 went too far.
- 12 Q. No problem.
- 13 A. Yeah, Headgate 22. Then here was the One section
- 14 --- or Two section.
- 15 O. Yeah.
- 16 A. Okay.
- 17 Q. Okay. So you've been back at Upper Big Branch
- about a year or so prior to the explosion?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Okay. And where did you work prior to the
- 21 explosion?
- 22 A. On Headgate 22.
- 23 Q. Which shift did you work?
- 24 A. I worked evening shift.
- Q. Who was your section boss?

- 1 A. My mind went blank.
- Q. That's okay. If you think of it, we'll get ---
- just let me know. Let's see. Who was up there? Was
- 4 it Brandon Bowling?
- 5 A. Not Brandon, no. Oh, shoot. He was the new boss.
- 6 O. Hutchens?
- 7 A. No. He was there ---.
- 8 Q. That was Smurf.
- 9 A. Smurf was there before.
- 10 O. Patrick Hilbert?
- 11 A. Yeah, Patrick.
- 12 Q. Okay.
- 13 A. Smurf quit about a month before that or maybe a
- little longer, two months before that happened.
- 15 Q. Okay. Thank you. And what did you do up there?
- 16 A. I was a miner operator.
- 17 Q. A miner operator. Which miner did you operate?
- 18 A. Left miner.
- 19 Q. Left miner, okay. What was the model of that left
- 20 miner?
- 21 A. It was 1212.
- 22 Q. 1212, okay.
- 23 A. I had to think about that a minute.
- Q. Were you there when they actually turned the
- 25 section out?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. So you've been working on 22 ---
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. --- the entire time that it had been under
- 5 development?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. What did you think about the ventilation on 22
- 8 Headgate?
- 9 A. It was terrible.
- 10 Q. Terrible. Any specific reason you recall that it
- 11 was terrible?
- 12 A. I couldn't call the times that --- I mean, you
- know, for instance, Patrick's first day of mining, you
- 14 know , his first shift up there, we walked from the end
- of the track to the power center and he had a safety
- 16 meeting and asked if there was anything anybody had.
- I said, yeah, that's as far as we're going. We ain't
- 18 got no air. He pulls anemometer out and it wouldn't
- 19 even turn. You know what I mean? And he pulled us
- off the section, you know, so --- and it was like that
- 21 all the time. You might have a little --- 10,000,
- 22 12,000, 13,000, 14,000, and then all of a sudden you
- wouldn't have nothing.
- 24 MR. FARLEY:
- 25 That was the section power center where

- 1 it wouldn't turn?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 MR. FALREY:
- 4 Okay. Sorry.
- 5 BY MR. SHERER:
- 6 Q. And did you carry an anemometer with you?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. What was the minimum quantity that you needed to
- 9 run the miner?
- 10 A. I think it was 8,000, if I'm remembering right, or
- 11 6,000. I can't remember.
- 12 Q. Roughly how often would you not have that 8,000 or
- that minimum quantity? Would it be once a week, once
- 14 a shift, once a month?
- 15 A. It was about every shift. It would come and go.
- 16 Q. Okay.
- 17 A. I mean, sometimes it had a sign hanging up in
- front of the power box, you know, a high voltage
- 19 sign, ---
- 20 O. Sure.
- 21 A. --- and you could look down there and sometimes
- that thing would be swinging and sometimes it wouldn't
- even be moving.
- 24 Q. Okay.
- 25 A. That was one of the ways of telling whether you

- 1 had any air or not, you know.
- 2 Q. We heard that from several people that worked on
- 3 this section. Do you have any idea of why the
- 4 ventilation quantity would fluctuate like that?
- 5 A. No, I really don't, not unless it had something to
- 6 do with these doors they had down here, all these
- 7 doors, you know. And I don't know --- really, I don't
- 8 know.
- 9 Q. When you didn't have enough air to mine, what
- 10 would you do to get air?
- 11 A. Well, we'd shut it down and go looking for it.
- 12 Q. And what would you normally find?
- 13 A. Well, there have been times that we would have ---
- 14 you know, they'd pull us from off the section and we'd
- 15 come down here and maybe hang a couple curtains down
- in this area.
- 17 Q. You're pointing toward the mouth of the
- 18 section ---
- 19 A. Yeah.
- 20 Q. --- outby?
- 21 A. I'm trying to pinpoint exactly where we would ---
- it seemed to me like it was right in here or
- 23 something. We would lose our air somewhere right in
- here. I don't know --- I don't see nothing marked on
- 25 that, what ---.

- 1 O. Here's an overcast. Here's the intake.
- 2 A. We had a lot of problems right here at this
- 3 overcast.
- 4 O. And this is an overcast over the belt. There's
- 5 also a regulator shown as part of that overcast and
- 6 then there's a door right next to it.
- 7 A. Can I use that?
- 8 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 9 Yeah. Why don't you use the blue
- 10 highlighter. You can circle that.
- 11 A. Let me think here. I want to make sure I'm doing
- 12 this right.
- 13 BY MR. SHERER:
- 0. Here's --- looks like the belt tail.
- 15 A. That's the belt head there; right? Overcast,
- overcast. These overcasts weren't put in until like
- 17 --- I mean, a lot of times we would hang a curtain I'm
- 18 thinking right in here ---
- 19 Q. Uh-huh (yes).
- 20 A. --- to get our air ---. I think our air was
- coming up this way. I can show them coming this way,
- though. It did come up this way.
- 23 O. Was it there?
- A. At one time it come through here, I think, and
- went that way.

- 1 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 2 And you're saying up from the ---
- 3 A. Yeah. Do you want me to mark it?
- 4 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 5 --- longwall section?
- 6 A. I think it went like this.
- 7 BY MR. SHERER:
- 8 Q. What we've heard from other testimony is there was
- 9 a major air change.
- 10 A. There was a lot of air changes.
- 11 Q. As the longwall is back behind this connector, the
- belts came up through it, the air came up through it,
- 13 I think you guys used to come in ---
- 14 A. Yeah.
- 15 Q. --- over the headgate of the longwall. And once
- 16 the ---.
- 17 A. Is this the track?
- 18 O. Yes.
- 19 A. Okay.
- Q. Once the wall pulled up to the point where it
- 21 started blocking off that connector, ---
- 22 A. Right.
- 23 Q. --- they had to reroute everything.
- A. Right. We traveled around this way ---
- 25 Q. Uh-huh (yes).

- 1 A. --- and back up.
- 2 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 3 When you say this way you're saying the
- 4 Seven North belt?
- 5 A. Yeah.
- 6 MR. SHERER:
- 7 Seven North mains, yeah.
- 8 A. Mains, yeah.
- 9 BY MR. SHERER:
- 10 Q. Okay. So you go out and possibly hang some
- 11 curtains. Did you ever have to open or close any of
- 12 the doors to get your air?
- 13 A. Not that I remember. Most times it was just a
- 14 matter of hanging the curtains down around this area
- to try to force the air to go up that way.
- 16 O. Sure. Okay.
- 17 A. And I'm trying to look here. I'm a little
- 18 backwards on this, but is this ---?
- 19 O. This is the Seven North belt.
- 20 A. That's the North belt.
- 21 Q. That's the stem that goes to the Glory Hole, and
- then they set a new mother drive up here.
- 23 A. I cut all that out right there.
- 24 Q. Okay.
- 25 ATTORNEY WILSON:

- 1 You cut all that out meaning the area
- 2 where they put the new belt drive?
- 3 A. Yeah. Yeah. I spent a couple weeks down there
- 4 cutting all that out on the evening shift. They took
- 5 me off the section there for about two weeks and I
- 6 spent two weeks down here cutting all this out.
- 7 BY MR. SHERER:
- 8 Q. You cut an awful lot, I bet.
- 9 A. Yeah. There's a lot of rock. But I'm looking at
- 10 the intake here. How does the intake run?
- 11 Q. It's now coming up ---
- 12 A. Right.
- 13 Q. --- you mean like the Number One entry, Seven
- 14 North mains comes across. It looks like it comes up
- under this --- probably over this belt, the overcast,
- 16 and then it comes ---.
- 17 A. If I remember right, our return come down and
- 18 overtop that overcast; right?
- 19 Q. Yeah. The return would have come actually down
- 20 here, come across the intake.
- 21 A. This is the return?
- 22 Q. This is the return down --- it comes through these
- two overcasts here and then out this way.
- A. But at one time it was going ---?
- Q. It was, yes. You're absolutely right. But I

- 1 think they changed that.
- 2 A. Right. They made so many air changes. That part
- of it, you know, I --- you know, that part of the air
- 4 change --- they made quite a few air changes. I mean,
- 5 there's no doubt about that.
- 6 Q. Let me ask you ---.
- 7 A. And you know, Everett Hager, when he got there ---
- 8 it was better when he got there. Things were getting
- 9 a lot better. I mean, he was --- he was really
- 10 working hard on it.
- 11 Q. About when did he get --- he go to the mine? When
- did he start working at UBB; do you recall?
- 13 A. It was probably, you know, only maybe two months
- 14 prior to this.
- 15 O. Okay.
- 16 A. Three maybe at the most, I'm thinking, you know.
- 17 Q. Okay.
- 18 A. I remember him tell me once when he first come
- 19 there, because I've knowed Everett for a long time,
- 20 that it would take him a month to get to know the
- 21 mines and two months to get to know the men. You
- know, he wasn't --- he didn't really have enough time
- to get to know, you know, ---.
- Q. But you say you had pretty consistent problems
- with just maintaining the minimum air quantities on

- 1 the section?
- 2 A. But we had the same problem when we drove every
- 3 bit of that up through there. It even got worse up
- 4 there on that end. And the gas was unreal up there on
- 5 that end.
- 6 Q. Okay.
- 7 A. The last 10, 12 breaks up there, I mean, I can
- 8 remember hitting seven, eight percent up there with
- 9 the left miner.
- 10 Q. Oh, jeez.
- 11 A. Yeah. And I remember when I left here, the last
- 12 --- I mean, the last week or two we was hitting two-
- tenths, three-tenths, four-tenths. I mean, it was
- 14 pretty common to hit, you know, two or four-tenths,
- 15 something like that.
- 16 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 17 Let's just make sure that the record is
- clear what we're referring to. When you were saying
- 19 that you were hitting seven or eight percent in that
- vein, you're talking about the headgate entry of the
- 21 longwall; correct?
- 22 A. Right.
- 23 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 24 All right.
- 25 A. On that very end up where the fan was --- before

- 1 the fan was drilled.
- 2 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 3 And you're pointing down towards the
- 4 Bandytown fan?
- 5 A. Yeah.
- 6 MR. FARLEY:
- 7 2009?
- 8 A. Yeah.
- 9 BY MR. SHERER:
- 10 Q. Let's talk a bit more about Headgate 22, then
- 11 we'll talk about that Headgate 21 that you drove last
- 12 year. What did you do when there wasn't sufficient
- 13 air? Would you talk to Mr. Hilbert about it? Would
- 14 you tell him you just didn't have enough air or ---?
- 15 A. Oh, yeah. He was --- you know, if you didn't have
- 16 no air, you shut down.
- 17 Q. Okay.
- 18 A. You know, there's no problem with that.
- 19 Q. Okay. So he basically shut down the mining.
- 20 Would he shut down the bolter?
- 21 A. He'd shut down the whole section.
- Q. Okay. About how often did he have to shut down
- 23 the whole section?
- 24 A. I know of him shutting it down three or four times
- a week. Sometimes it might be just for a couple of

- 1 hours, ---
- O. Sure.
- 3 A. --- sometimes a little longer. And I know that
- 4 several times he pulled us --- I don't know how --- I
- 5 couldn't count, you know, but I know he's pulled us
- off --- completely off the section, and we'd come down
- 7 there and start looking for air, you know.
- Q. Now, I've been reading the production reports from
- 9 Headgate 22 and there's no mention of air or
- 10 ventilation. Do you know why that's just downtime?
- 11 A. Is that what they're putting on the report, just
- 12 downtime?
- Q. Yeah. Do you know anything about that? Did you
- ever hear anything about that?
- 15 A. Well, I've heard them say, you know, they didn't
- 16 know they was going to cover it up, you know.
- 17 O. Sure.
- 18 A. But you know, I don't read their production
- 19 reports, you know.
- 20 Q. Sure. Now, we also understand that those reports
- 21 were called out at --- I think it was 9:00, 1:00 and
- 22 --- about every two or three hours --- two hours, I
- 23 think. Have you heard Mr. Hilbert call those out?
- A. No. I'm always at the miner.
- 25 Q. Okay.

- 1 A. You know, I'm never around the phone or nothing.
- Q. Okay.
- 3 A. I know he's left me before and said, I got to go
- 4 call out, you know, but ---.
- 5 Q. Sure. Now, you mentioned that you had seen
- 6 two-tenths, three-tenths of methane.
- 7 A. Uh-huh (yes).
- Q. I guess that was on the methane monitor on the
- 9 miner?
- 10 A. Oh, yeah.
- 11 Q. What's the highest concentration of methane you
- 12 recall seeing on Headgate 22?
- 13 A. That's probably about four-tenths.
- 14 Q. Okay.
- 15 A. And it was I think probably the last seven or
- eight breaks. You know, I think probably the first
- ten breaks or so we didn't hit nothing, and on up here
- 18 the last four or five breaks it started getting a
- 19 little worse.
- 20 Q. A little gassier?
- 21 A. A little gassier, yeah.
- 22 Q. When you first make a cut, can you hear the gas
- 23 coming out of the ribs?
- 24 A. I don't think on --- I never did hear no gas on
- 25 the --- up here. Up there you could hear it.

- 1 Q. And you're pointing back to ---
- 2 A. To the ---.
- 3 Q. --- Headgate 21?
- 4 A. Right. But on --- right here you can --- but I
- 5 don't think you --- you could see it on the readout,
- 6 but you couldn't hear it.
- 7 Q. Okay. What was the roof and ribs like on this
- 8 section?
- 9 A. It was pretty decent.
- 10 Q. About how high were you mining on this section?
- 11 A. Everything was probably about six foot, give or
- 12 take a little.
- Q. Were you taking any top or bottom?
- 14 A. Taking a little bit of top.
- 15 Q. Okay. What sort of top was it, shale or
- 16 sandstone?
- 17 A. It was shale.
- 18 Q. Okay. Do you recall anything unusual the week or
- 19 so prior to the explosion?
- 20 A. No.
- Q. Were you scheduled to work Monday night?
- 22 A. Yes. I came back on a Monday night, April the
- 23 5th.
- Q. What's the last shift prior to that that you
- worked on Headgate 22?

- 1 A. I was off Friday, Saturday, Sunday, so it would
- 2 have been Thursday night.
- 3 Q. Thursday night. Do you recall anything unusual
- 4 that occurred on Thursday night?
- 5 A. No.
- 6 Q. Had you ever smelled anything that smelled like
- 7 kerosene when you were on Headgate 22?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. Kind of a petroleum-like smell?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. Okay. Do you recall if the puddles and such on
- the floor, do you recall if they were bubbling much?
- 13 A. Yeah.
- 14 Q. Had you noticed any change in that?
- 15 A. It was pretty common on Headgate 21 to see it all
- the time. But over on Headgate 22, in Number Three
- entry, the water laid on that side --- in Number Three
- entry, and you know, I mean, it was common that you
- 19 seen the water --- the bubbling through the water.
- 20 Q. Was it a little bit of bubbling or was it a
- 21 rolling sort of bubbling?
- 22 A. It just come and went. It was there. It was, you
- 23 know, always there, but it was --- sometimes it was
- 24 rolling and sometimes it was just real light, you
- 25 know.

- 1 Q. Okay. What about the thumping and bumping? Was
- 2 there --- did you notice any of that the week or so
- 3 prior to the explosion?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. Okay. So everything was pretty quiet on the
- 6 section?
- 7 A. Yeah.
- 8 Q. Did you have any floor heave on the section?
- 9 A. Any what?
- 10 Q. Floor heave or floor hooving?
- 11 A. None that I know of.
- 12 Q. Okay. You never had to go back and grade somehow
- the roadway or anything like that?
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. Okay. You'd be the guy that would know about
- 16 that?
- 17 A. Yeah. Yeah.
- 18 Q. Okay. What about the rock dust on the section,
- 19 can you recall the last shift or two you worked what
- it looked like?
- 21 A. Rock dusting was very little hand dusting. I
- think Terry Moore filled in a couple shifts --- a
- couple shifts for Pat. And as far as machine dusting,
- that was the only two shifts, and he made them do it
- when he was up there. That was the only two shifts

- 1 that I recall that it was ever dusted with machine
- 2 dust.
- Q. And do you recall about when Mr. Moore did that in
- 4 relationship to the explosion?
- 5 A. If I was guessing, I would probably say probably a
- 6 month prior to that explosion. I mean, again, I ---
- 7 it's been a long time, you know what I mean?
- 8 Q. Sure. Yeah.
- 9 A. But now, that was the only two times that I ever
- 10 recalled that there was ever any machine dusting done
- 11 up there.
- 12 Q. And then when you machine dusted, I assume that it
- 13 looked good?
- 14 A. Yeah.
- Q. How was it looking immediately prior to the
- 16 explosion? Would you say it was good, fair?
- 17 A. Well, now, if I remember right, the beltlines was
- 18 rode up and I remember them putting some --- a couple
- 19 --- one or two machines over on the beltline, and the
- 20 beltline looked good. As far as Two and Three entry,
- it was pretty poor.
- 22 Q. Okay. Who normally did the rock dusting on the
- 23 section when you guys were mining coal? Was it the
- scoop operator?
- 25 A. Yeah.

- 1 Q. Do you think you had enough time to keep up with
- 2 the dust?
- 3 A. The scoop man got a lot to do, you know, ---
- 4 Q. Sure.
- 5 A. --- but I mean, you know, time --- you know, it
- 6 takes a lot of time to get everything together. And
- 7 then you're driving three entries, and it's hard to
- get around up there. It's hard to get around
- 9 equipment.
- 10 O. Sure.
- 11 A. It's almost impossible on that, really it is on
- 12 that.
- Q. I hear you. I don't know how you guys do it with
- two miners, two bolters.
- 15 A. I mean, you --- it's like a traffic jam up there,
- 16 you know, so you know ---.
- 17 Q. Okay. Let me ask you a little different question.
- 18 Have you noticed any unusual fatigue at the end of the
- 19 shift?
- 20 A. As in?
- 21 Q. Like when you got off from work, you just didn't
- have enough energy to do much.
- 23 A. Yeah. I'm always wore out when I get off work.
- 24 O. Yeah.
- 25 A. I don't know, you know, is that ---?

- 1 Q. I understand that. But had you noticed that it
- 2 had possibly gotten worse or you had gotten more tired
- 3 while you were working on this headgate section?
- 4 A. Not really.
- 5 Q. Okay. Thank you. Do you think --- just in
- 6 general, do you think the ventilation in the mine was
- 7 adequate?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. Why do you not think that it was adequate? We
- 10 talked about the section. Is there anything specific
- in the other parts of the mine that you think was
- 12 inadequate?
- 13 A. Well, you know, I walked a lot of the intake and,
- 14 you know, it seemed like when you got down to about
- 15 --- I don't know, I think this is probably what, 78
- Break somewhere in here or something.
- 17 Q. Seventy-eight (78) would be ---
- 18 A. Right here maybe.
- 19 Q. --- down here.
- 20 A. Is that right?
- Q. Yeah. Here's 75. Seventy-eight (78) is right
- here.
- 23 A. Okay. Where was the doors at, right in here?
- Q. The doors are marked right here and right here.
- 25 A. Okay. I think right in front of these doors is

- 1 where we --- this was the intake here; right?
- Q. Uh-huh (yes).
- 3 A. From here on out we had good air.
- 4 Q. Uh-huh (yes).
- 5 A. And it seemed like at times from here to here we
- 6 had good air.
- 7 Q. Uh-huh (yes).
- 8 A. You know, but when it got to here, it was just
- 9 like you lost everything.
- 10 Q. Okay. And about ---?
- 11 A. And it would come and go. I mean, it was just
- 12 like where --- I don't --- you know --- but if you
- ever walked this, I mean the intake, it was good, and
- it was good from here on out.
- 15 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 16 Okay. When you say it was good from
- 17 here ---?
- 18 A. From ---.
- 19 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 20 Up the Number Six North mains and then up
- 21 the headgate of the longwall ---
- 22 A. Right.
- 23 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 24 --- to about the crossover; is that
- 25 right?

- 1 A. Right.
- 2 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 3 All right.
- 4 BY MR. SHERER;
- Q. And why do you think there was a problem with
- 6 ventilation in that intake?
- 7 A. I don't know. I mean, it's just like when it got
- 8 to here, it just --- it come and went, you know. It's
- 9 just like where could it went to, you know what I
- 10 mean?
- 11 Q. Okay.
- 12 A. I mean, it's just like, you know, ---. This
- overcast right here, ---.
- 14 Q. Uh-huh (yes).
- 15 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 16 And again, you're pointing to outby the
- 17 22 Headgate?
- 18 A. Right. I can remember air coming overtop and
- 19 underneath it, but you could go through a door and
- 20 come around and nothing would come overtop of it.
- 21 That would be your return. This was your return;
- 22 right?
- 23 BY MR. SHERER:
- Q. The return is here. The return came down Number
- 25 three and then turned and went down ---.

- 1 A. Okay. It went over this overcast?
- Q. Yeah.
- 3 A. Okay. And at one time our return come down this
- 4 way and went where, out that way?
- 5 Q. Yeah, used to just dump back this way, and that
- 6 had been rerouted, we understand, to go back ---.
- 7 A. Right. Because I remember it was down for two or
- 8 three weeks because we didn't have no return up here.
- 9 And we was down here on Headgate 22, doing all kinds
- of crazy stuff, because we didn't have no return up
- 11 here.
- 12 Q. And do you recall about when you were down for
- 13 those three weeks?
- 14 A. No. I know that it was as couple months prior to
- 15 that.
- 16 O. Okay. It was after Christmas?
- 17 A. Probably, just guessing. I mean, you know, it's
- 18 been a while.
- 19 O. Sure.
- 20 A. But I also know the longwall was down for a week
- over that, too.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 MR. FARLEY:
- 24 We understand that the return was
- rerouted around February 10th. Now, if that rings any

- 1 bell, that was Super Bowl Sunday.
- 2 A. Okay.
- 3 MR. FARLEY:
- 4 We understand that the return off 22
- 5 Headgate at that point went down the Number One entry
- 6 here in Seven North and then it was rerouted to where
- 7 it goes through the crossover and down Four and Five
- 8 and then the longwall headgate entry. Does that ring
- 9 a bell?
- 10 A. I remember them rerouting it, and I didn't know
- 11 exactly where it was going to after that. and I don't
- think nobody else did neither because, like I said,
- our return was supposed to go across that overcast,
- 14 and there was nothing coming across. It was trying to
- 15 come down the beltline. I mean, it was just like they
- was doubling the curtains up here and everything, and
- it was trying to force --- the air was trying to force
- 18 itself down the beltline. We couldn't get air in
- 19 Number One. We had one mine inspector that wrote low
- 20 air in Number One, but he let them run in Number Two
- 21 and Three. And I don't know if you all remember that
- or not, but it would force itself to come back down
- the beltline. It wouldn't go back down Number Three
- entry. And it was a big problem. I mean, it was ---.
- 25 BY MR. SHERER:

- 1 O. Sure sounds like it.
- 2 A. I mean, it was unreal. I mean, you couldn't force
- 3 it to go down Number Three.
- 4 Q. So it sounds to me like you just didn't have a
- 5 section return, ---
- 6 A. Uh-uh (no).
- 7 Q. --- in effect?
- 8 A. No, absolutely not.
- 9 Q. Okay.
- 10 A. Never did.
- 11 Q. Was it that way when you first started the section
- 12 or was it ---?
- 13 A. The first ten breaks wasn't that bad because, if I
- remember right, our return was --- I don't think they
- had a stopping here. I think our air was pulling down
- this way. It was pulling down ---. I mean, the first
- ten breaks wasn't that bad. And then when they built
- 18 that --- I think they built a stopping here, stopping
- 19 that off maybe or something. I don't know. But when
- they did that, then that's when the air got plum
- 21 terrible.
- Q. Do you know who made those changes?
- 23 A. It was before Everett got there, so ---.
- Q. Who was in charge of making ventilation changes in
- 25 this mine?

- 1 A. I couldn't tell you that.
- Q. Okay.
- 3 A. I don't know who was --- I don't know who was
- 4 making all the ventilation changes. I really don't.
- 5 I know it was crazy, though.
- 6 Q. Do you think people were making changes while you
- 7 guys were on the section?
- 8 A. Something was going on because the air would
- 9 always come and go.
- 10 Q. Okay.
- 11 A. Massey had a policy, 20,000 or don't run. They
- never had no 20,000 on that section.
- 13 Q. Would they run?
- 14 A. They'd run with 10,000 or 11,000, you know, one
- miner at a time. And you'd work yourself to death
- trying to get your air over to the miner, you know,
- 17 and then ---.
- Q. Now, you say you talked to the section boss, Mr.
- 19 Hilbert, about that. Did you ever talk to anybody
- 20 else about low air?
- 21 A. There was a couple mine inspectors come up there
- we talked to. We had one mine inspector one day. We
- 23 was coming in. He was an electrical inspector. I
- don't know his name. And the men stopped him and told
- 25 him we didn't have no air on the section. The next

- 1 morning he sent a bunch of people out and they shut
- 2 the section down. And that was a week prior or two
- 3 weeks prior to April the 5th.
- 4 Q. Do you think upper management knew about the lack
- of air on this section?
- 6 A. I've been around Everett Hager for a long time,
- 7 and he'll tell you, if you ain't got air, don't run.
- 8 He goes by the book. And Terry Moore is the same way.
- 9 And these two guys got throwed in on this just a
- 10 couple months prior. You know, they really didn't
- 11 have a chance to get to know this mine and what was
- going on. And that's the way Massey is. They change
- people around, you know, to where they don't want
- 14 nobody to know what's going on. I mean, that's the
- 15 way I feel about it.
- 16 O. Sure.
- 17 A. I mean, you got Everett, he's --- I mean, and
- 18 Terry Moore, both will tell you, you know. And if
- 19 they come up there and you're running without air,
- they'd fire you in a heartbeat. They'd rather see it
- 21 shut down than you run that section, you know, ---.
- 22 And that's the way we done it. We didn't have no air,
- we didn't run. We didn't run. You know, most of the
- time we didn't run 100, 150 feet a shift because we
- 25 didn't have no air.

- 1 Q. Okay.
- 2 A. And if we got that --- a lot of times --- you
- know, sometimes it might only be 50 or 80 foot.
- 4 Q. Do you think you guys were getting pressure to run
- 5 coal even if you didn't have air?
- 6 A. There's always pressure there, yeah.
- 7 Q. Okay. When inspectors were on the property, did
- 8 somebody call in and tell you that they were on the
- 9 property or tell the section boss?
- 10 A. Most of the time they got to the section before
- 11 they got there.
- 12 Q. Okay. Thank you. I know you're --- you've
- probably read all the stuff about methane monitors in
- the paper. Did you ever have any problem with the
- methane monitoring system on the miners ---
- 16 A. No.
- 17 O. --- on this section?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. Do you recall the last time you saw somebody
- 20 calibrate those methane monitors?
- 21 A. I can't recall, no.
- 22 Q. Okay. Do you think that compared to your handheld
- instrument, the methane monitor on the miner you ran
- seemed to be giving reasonable readings?
- 25 A. Yeah. I compared them.

- 1 Q. Okay. And then they were --- did they compare?
- 2 A. Yeah.
- 3 Q. Okay. Thank you.
- 4 A. And we did do that. And when Smurf was there, we
- 5 compared them a lot. And actually, you know, it got
- 6 to a point, Smurf knowed somebody was going to get in
- 7 trouble is why he quit way before he did, because he
- 8 knowed and he told the men he wasn't going down when
- 9 it happened, and that's why he quit, because he knowed
- 10 the air was not right most of the time. And I'm
- 11 pretty sure he'll tell you that.
- 12 Q. Okay. Thank you. Now, let's talk a bit about
- this Headgate 21, when you were driving that. Did you
- start when they first turned out from the Seven North
- 15 mains?
- 16 A. No. I think I started --- don't hold me to it, I
- 17 mean, probably --- I'm saying probably 20 breaks
- 18 from ---.
- 19 O. From the mouth?
- A. I'm saying around 40, 45 Break maybe.
- 21 Q. Okay.
- A. Maybe 50, somewhere in there.
- 23 Q. Okay. So you started about the upper third of it?
- 24 A. Yeah.
- Q. And then did you drive all the way out to the end

- 1 of it?
- 2 A. All the way to the end.
- 3 O. Tell us about that. You mentioned low air and
- 4 high methane.
- 5 A. Well, the air was decent on up to probably --- you
- 6 know, probably up into this area. And I can't see.
- 7 Does that say 80 or something?
- 8 O. That's 95.
- 9 A. Oh, 95?
- 10 O. Yeah.
- 11 A. 100, 95. We had decent air. I mean, it wasn't
- 12 like --- from there --- from 95 on out it was just
- terrible, you know. It was awful.
- Q. Just didn't have enough air to ---. Let me ask
- 15 you this. When you didn't have enough air, did you
- 16 shut down?
- 17 A. Yeah.
- 18 O. Okay.
- 19 A. We didn't run very good coal from then on out. It
- 20 was --- you know, because you didn't have air. And it
- 21 was so hot up in there, that every --- all my
- coveralls and everything, I cut the sleeves out of
- every one of them. I'd go to bit the miner up, and
- I'd be wringing wet.
- 25 Q. Oh, jeez.

- 1 A. That's how hot it was up there.
- Q. That's pretty hot.
- 3 A. That's hot. I mean, ---.
- 4 Q. Was there a lot of water when you was up in that
- 5 area?
- 6 A. Yeah. We had a lot of water up through there in
- 7 places, yeah. Most of it in the Number Three entry
- 8 was knee deep or deeper. They had a couple pumps set
- 9 up through there to take care of some of it.
- 10 Q. Okay. Was the water draining toward the face as
- 11 you were cutting through there?
- 12 A. It was like it was trying to go with us, yeah.
- 13 Q. Okay. Now, you mentioned some real high methane
- readings. What do you recall about those?
- 15 A. I just --- you mean, how high they was or ---?
- 16 O. Yeah.
- 17 A. I remember --- if I --- I remember one time up
- there up to eight, five, six, seven, eight percent.
- 19 And that was pretty common there for a couple weeks.
- 20 Q. And that was what was showing on the methane
- 21 monitor on the miner?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. Did your handheld unit show similar values; do you
- 24 recall?
- 25 A. It was similar, yeah.

- 1 Q. Okay. What did you guys do when you ran into that
- 2 sort of methane?
- 3 A. We shut the section down and the majority of the
- 4 people went to the power box. And usually the boss
- 5 would come and get me to help ventilate or take care
- 6 of it.
- 7 Q. Were you able to successfully take care of it just
- 8 through changing curtains or fly pads or ---?
- 9 A. It took a while. It took time to get rid of it.
- 10 Q. Did you ever have to put curtain up the middle of
- 11 the entry?
- 12 A. Yeah.
- Q. Who was your section boss when that was going on?
- 14 A. I can't remember his name. He was an old man.
- 15 O. Okay. If you recall, ---
- 16 A. Oh, goodness.
- 17 Q. --- let us know.
- 18 A. Do you have any bosses' names I can ---? I'd know
- 19 it if I heard of it.
- Q. We don't have a list handy. We've got a list of
- all former employees, but there's about 500 people on
- 22 it.
- 23 A. I can't think.
- Q. That's okay. Don't worry about it.
- 25 A. Wickline. Bobbie Wickline.

- 1 Q. Wickline, okay. That rings a bell. Thank you.
- In your opinion, and this is all I'm asking, what do
- 3 you think caused this explosion?
- 4 A. Do the longwall's return return down this way?
- 5 Q. There was some return up the headgate. Most of it
- 6 went down the tailgate. We know that the headgate had
- 7 a lot of problems with water. It just about roofed
- 8 out.
- 9 A. Right. But their return --- all this was their
- 10 return; right?
- 11 Q. Uh-huh (yes). We think there was about 500,000
- 12 CFM going up through the Bandytown fan at the time of
- 13 the explosion.
- 14 A. I'll tell you, that three weeks they had us shut
- down because we didn't have a return up here, I was
- 16 all up in there, and a lot of that was --- you know,
- they built the cribs over here. You know, a lot of
- 18 places you could barely squeeze through. And they had
- 19 several men that refused to even go up in there
- 20 because the top, you know, it just --- you know, you
- 21 had two sets of cribs and you could turn sideways and
- 22 you could barely squeeze through, you know. And what
- 23 return they had up that way was just --- it was no
- 24 good. They didn't have no return, you know. And they
- 25 had a lot of water back in there, but you know, I

- 1 couldn't say what caused it.
- Q. Okay.
- 3 A. There was a lot of gas --- but that fan was there.
- 4 You know, there was a lot of gas on that upper end up
- 5 there. But that fan you would have thought would have
- 6 took care of that up there, you know.
- 7 Q. Sure.
- 8 A. I don't know. I really don't know. I'd like to
- 9 know myself.
- 10 Q. We're just asking people for their opinions
- 11 because sometimes somebody will have a good idea. So
- 12 we appreciate that.
- 13 A. I ain't got no idea.
- 14 Q. Okay.
- 15 MR. SHERER:
- 16 That's all the questions I've got for you
- 17 right now.
- 18 EXAMINATION
- 19 BY MR. FARLEY:
- 20 Q. Mr. Hulgan, I'll be trying to clarify some
- 21 questions. I may be jumping around, so be patient
- 22 with me.
- 23 A. Okay.
- Q. Is it correct that Hilbert replaced Smurf when
- 25 Smurf left?

- 1 A. Yeah.
- Q. Do you remember about when Smurf left?
- 3 A. I couldn't remember if it was a month or two
- 4 months. It seemed to me like it was more like two
- 5 months prior to April 5th.
- 6 Q. And for the record, Smurf is Richard Hutchinson?
- 7 A. Yeah.
- 8 MR. SHERER:
- 9 Hutchens.
- 10 MR. FARLEY:
- 11 Hutchens. Excuse me.
- 12 BY MR. FARLEY:
- 13 Q. You talked about the high voltage sign section
- power center on 22 Headgate. If I understood you
- 15 correctly, that was usually a pretty good indicator of
- 16 how your ventilation was; is that correct?
- 17 A. Yeah. Yeah. You know, where we ain't got
- anemometers or whatever, you know, you could be up
- 19 there running coal, and all of a sudden, you didn't
- 20 have no air. And all you had to do was just walk
- 21 around the corner and look down there at that power
- box, and if there weren't no air, that was the end of
- it, he'd shut it down.
- Q. Okay. You know, at times when the ventilation was
- not good, the sign would just simply be hanging still;

- 1 is that correct?
- 2 A. Still. Wouldn't move at all.
- Q. I guess as the ventilation improved, the more the
- 4 sign would ---
- 5 A. It would swing ---
- 6 O. --- wave?
- 7 A. --- back side to side.
- 8 Q. All right. And I think you said that on Friday
- 9 --- or excuse me, Thursday, the last shift that you
- 10 worked prior to the explosion, it was straight,
- 11 hanging down; is that correct?
- 12 A. It come and went, so --- you know, when we left
- there, it was --- I can't really remember if it was
- swinging or not, you know, but I think when we left
- there we had decent air. I think we had 11,000.
- Q. And when you say 11,000 you mean in the last open
- 17 crosscut?
- 18 A. At the power box. We had 11,000 at the power box.
- 19 O. Meaning intake air?
- 20 A. In the intake air?
- 21 Q. Oh, yeah?
- 22 A. Yeah. We --- I remember --- I had been with the
- 23 boss, checking air, and I'm pretty sure 11,000 is what
- he said he had.
- 25 Q. Okay.

- 1 A. Because you know, when he took over bossing, when
- 2 he took Smurf's place, it was pretty common that he
- 3 was pulling his anemometer out and checking every cut
- 4 before we run. I mean, you know, he was new at it and
- 5 he was trying to be --- do it right, you know what I
- 6 mean?
- 7 Q. Sure.
- 8 A. And he did. He done it right.
- 9 Q. Now, how was it earlier that week and the week
- 10 before the explosion?
- 11 A. Sometimes you had it, sometimes you didn't.
- 12 Q. It comes and goes?
- 13 A. It comes and goes.
- 14 Q. Now, I'm trying to understand your shift schedule
- 15 at the 22 Headgate. Am I correct that you worked
- 16 straight evening shift?
- 17 A. Right.
- 18 Q. Now, there was also a straight dayshift crew; is
- 19 that correct?
- 20 A. Right.
- 21 Q. Now, was there also a crew which would work three
- 22 on the day and three on the evening and then three
- 23 off?
- 24 A. Right.
- 25 Q. That sort of gave everybody ---?

- 1 A. Yeah. I think it was five on, three off, five on,
- 2 three off, I believe is how it was.
- 3 Q. So you had three crews working --- three extra
- 4 crews working that section?
- 5 A. Right.
- 6 Q. Okay. Now, you indicated that you spent a couple
- of weeks carrying belt channel and so forth down there
- 8 for the mother drive construction site at the mouth of
- 9 the 22 Headgate.
- 10 A. Right.
- 11 Q. Now, did anybody ever tell you that the work at
- the mother drive construction site had a negative
- impact on the 22 Headgate ventilation? Did anybody
- ever --- did you ever hear any discussion like that?
- 15 A. Yeah, I did. I remember that --- I recall them
- 16 coming off the section and coming down and hanging
- their curtain and stuff. When I cut this, all my air
- 18 --- I was cutting it going towards the head, and the
- 19 air was going --- you know, the dust was going away
- 20 from it. So I never had no trouble with no dust, but
- 21 there was several times that they come down and re-
- 22 hung curtains or something here, thinking that we was
- 23 stealing their air from them, you know. But that only
- lasted a couple weeks, and we still had the problems
- 25 up there, you know. Some way, somehow that they split

- 1 the air to where both of us was supposed to have air,
- 2 you know. I was supposed to have air when I was
- 3 cutting that head hole and the section was supposed to
- 4 have their air, too. And at that time, if I remember
- 5 right, our intake was --- our air was coming from over
- 6 here and coming over like this and up. And I don't
- 7 know where it was coming from, but it was coming
- 8 across right in here, these two entries right here,
- 9 and coming over this way and coming up.
- 10 Q. You're pointing to ---
- 11 A. I don't know what that is.
- 12 Q. --- the north side of the 22 Headgate belt.
- 13 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 14 Do you want to mark it? Do you want to
- mark the entries with a green highlighter where
- 16 you recall ---?
- 17 BY MR. FARLEY:
- 18 O. As best we understand it, this intake that you see
- here, which is what basically makes its way to the 22
- Headgate, was a return prior to February 10th, as best
- 21 we understand.
- 22 A. Okay.
- Q. So maybe that's --- if that helps you.
- 24 A. I think all that was done --- that was changed
- 25 after the head hole was already cut and done, the head

- 1 was set and everything. The belt was put in.
- 2 0. Okay.
- A. I mean, don't hold me to that, but I'm pretty sure
- 4 it was. But I do know that our air was coming right
- 5 through here and over and up to the section.
- 6 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 7 Why don't you mark that with the green
- 8 highlighter just so that it's clear what you're
- 9 talking about?
- 10 A. All right. I'm sitting here, trying to think,
- 11 before I mark that. The track on this entry --- this
- 12 was the belt; right?
- 13 BY MR. FARLEY:
- 14 Q. Uh-huh (yes).
- 15 A. The track was in this entry here; right?
- 16 Q. Uh-huh (yes).
- 17 A. And the track went up this way; right? Am I
- 18 right?
- 19 MR. SHERER:
- 20 I think so.
- 21 A. So I'm thinking our air was coming across right
- here and right here, coming up like this, to our
- 23 section. See, I remember us hanging --- before they
- 24 put these overcasts in, I remember us hanging curtains
- 25 right here and right here and right --- let's see.

- 1 Now, is this the belt? What is this? This is the
- belt line; right?
- 3 MR. SHERER:
- 4 That's the belt, yes, sir, from the
- 5 tailgate section.
- 6 A. Okay. We would hang curtains here and here, maybe
- 7 right here, too, blocking the air from going this way
- 8 and trying to force it up that way.
- 9 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 10 Block it from going across towards the
- longwall?
- 12 A. Yes. And that was before this section was really
- up and running. You know what I mean?
- 14 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 15 Let me go ahead. I'll mark this map as
- 16 Exhibit Hulgan Three.
- 17 (M. Hulgan Exhibit Three marked for
- 18 identification.)
- 19 MR. SHERER:
- 20 Can we get you to draw a line out from
- 21 that green line that you marked and just label it ---?
- 22 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 23 Label that over there intake.
- 24 WITNESS COMPLIES
- 25 MR. SHERER:

- 1 Okay. Thank you.
- 2 A. Now, I don't know how they was right in that area
- 3 to come across it, but I remember it was coming across
- 4 the track. We had a double door there, if I remember,
- 5 might be a double door right there. That's what I'm
- 6 looking at. Is that that double door?
- 7 MR. SHERER:
- 8 That's a stopping there. There's a
- 9 double door right here.
- 10 A. Double door right here?
- 11 MR. SHERER:
- 12 Yes. There's a double door here and then
- there's two ---.
- 14 A. They was keeping that double door closed and
- letting the air come around this way up to the
- 16 section.
- 17 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 18 You're referring to the double doors
- 19 again just outby the mouth of the ---
- 20 A. Right.
- 21 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 22 --- 22 Headgate?
- 23 A. Just seemed like --- they made a lot of changes
- here. There was a set of double doors here, too.
- 25 They took them out. At last, there was two set of

- double doors here; right? There was two set of double
- doors there, was. I don't know if they there now or
- 3 not. Oh, here they are. They're marked right here.
- 4 MR. SHERER:
- 5 Yeah. There's a set of double doors in
- 6 the same break and then here's another set that go
- 7 across an intersection.
- 8 A. Our intake air was coming this way; right?
- 9 MR. SHERER:
- 10 Uh-huh (yes).
- 11 A. That's how it was. This was changed so many
- 12 times, this area right here. In just the couple
- months I was up there, there was doors. They moved
- these doors a dozen times. I mean, at one time they
- 15 was back here. These overcasts, they had been ---
- 16 that one was act ---. I think this one here was the
- 17 one that was active.
- 18 BY MR. FARLEY:
- 19 Q. Okay. Now, again, I'm trying to clarify some
- 20 things. I'm not trying to trick you, ---
- 21 A. Okay.
- 22 Q. --- so don't get that impression at all. In
- reading the pre-shift/on-shift report books for 22
- Headgate and the longwall for the month of March,
- 25 based on the entries in the books, now, assuming the

- 1 entries in the book were accurate and can be believed,
- all right, that's an assumption, now, the pre-shift
- 3 report for the month of March for the longwall, again,
- 4 on the assumption that it's accurate, shows that the
- 5 intake --- the main intake for the longwall over here
- on the headgate side was around 115,000 cubic feet per
- 7 minute around the first of March. Now, by the end of
- 8 March it's in the mid 50s, 55,000 to 60,000. Now, in
- 9 reading the pre-shift/on-shift book for 22 Headgate,
- 10 now, the quantity of air shown in the last open break
- readings is a little bit better towards the end of
- 12 March, at least if you can believe what's in the
- 13 books.
- 14 A. Uh-huh (yes).
- Q. Now, if I were to go --- I can't give you exact
- numbers, but the average goes up probably 3,000,
- 4,000, 5,000 cubic feet per minute in the last open
- break readings. Now, am I accurate --- is it accurate
- or, you know, based on your actual experience, you
- were there, ---
- 21 A. I remember that.
- 22 Q. --- did the ventilation actually improve a little
- 23 bit on Headgate 22 for a month?
- 24 A. For a couple weeks it did. I remember that. I
- 25 remember that change.

- 1 Q. Okay.
- 2 A. Yes, I do.
- 3 Q. Okay.
- 4 A. It did improve some, yes.
- 5 Q. Because based on the description of the decrease
- 6 in air on the longwall, I mean, my question is, if it
- 7 didn't improve a little bit, then where did it go? I
- 8 know you don't know the answer to that, but you see
- 9 where I'm going here?
- 10 A. Yes. I do remember that change. I do remember
- for a week or two it was a little better, and it's
- 12 just like it wasn't there no more.
- 13 Q. Okay. All right.
- 14 A. I mean, I honestly believe they just didn't really
- have --- they had air come in, but they just didn't
- 16 have nowhere for it to go.
- 17 Q. And that's why I asked you that question
- 18 because ---
- 19 A. Right.
- 20 Q. --- you got to basically cut it in half ---
- 21 A. Right.
- 22 Q. --- on the longwall, and again, where did it go?
- 23 A. Because you know, at one time I remember they was
- 24 trying to force it down through here and it wouldn't
- go, you know, or they wouldn't let the longwall and

- 1 the one section there go together, if I remember
- 2 right, you know.
- 3 Q. Okay.
- 4 A. That's why they shut us --- we was down for three
- 5 weeks building them Kennedy stoppings up through there
- 6 and stuff.
- 7 Q. Okay.
- 8 A. It was crazy, you know. And then they made that
- 9 air change and tried to send the air somewhere else.
- 10 And that's what I was saying, the air was coming
- 11 underneath that overcast right there, up on the
- 12 section, but there was nothing coming back overtop of
- it on your return, you know. I mean, just --- you
- 14 would think you could put that air somewhere on the
- 15 return, but it ain't going --- you know what I mean?
- I mean, it's the truth. I mean, we --- and there was
- 17 --- I don't know how many times I went to that
- 18 overcast right there. I mean, all the times that we
- 19 was pulled off the section, you go through that door,
- you'd have 40,000 coming underneath. By the time you
- 21 got up here, you wouldn't have 10,000. and then when
- 22 it come --- you go to the returns side of it, there
- was nothing going across the top of it. You couldn't
- 24 make it go across the top of it.
- Q. Now, based on what I'm hearing from you about Mr.

- 1 Hutchens and Mr. Hilbert, your two foremen, that you
- 2 worked for, is it fair to say that you had confidence
- 3 in those two men?
- 4 A. Yeah. Smurf was --- he was the same way. If you
- 5 didn't have no air, he'd shut it down.
- 6 Q. Okay. My understanding of how your miner sections
- 7 were staffed --- when I say staffed, you know, how you
- 8 had your people designated as far as their jobs were
- 9 concerned, you never had someone whose sole duty was
- 10 designated to take care of the ventilation; is that
- 11 correct?
- 12 A. Not that I know of.
- 13 Q. Did Massey companies ever have a so-called
- ventilation man or a ventilation person?
- 15 A. No, not that I know of.
- 16 Q. Have you ever worked anywhere that it did?
- 17 A. No. You took care of your curtain and your air
- 18 you was working, and your boss come and checked it and
- 19 told you, you could run or not run.
- 20 Q. Okay. The reason I asked the question is, you
- 21 know, in another lifetime, many years ago, it was
- 22 actually the section boss. We actually had a guy who
- was a ventilation person.
- 24 A. Right.
- Q. Do you remember those days?

- 1 A. Yes, I do. I really do.
- 2 Q. All right.
- 3 A. I do remember that.
- 4 Q. All right. Did you ever hear any stories about
- 5 anybody being stationed at specific locations in the
- 6 mines, at doors or regulators, to adjust the air based
- 7 on where they thought an inspector might be going on a
- 8 particular day?
- 9 A. No. Yes and no. Let's put it this way. They
- 10 could get air up there when an inspector was coming up
- 11 there. So we always thought down here on this
- headgate that they was opening or closing a door down
- here to give us more air.
- 14 Q. Okay.
- 15 A. And that's what we really thought, but --- you
- 16 know, that's --- I can't remember where the doors was
- 17 at. Right here maybe. Right there.
- 18 O. About right there. And I'm not a ventilation
- 19 expert, and I'm not a rocket scientist either, but if
- 20 you want to do ---.
- 21 A. Our intake crossed right here; right. And then
- 22 at ---.
- Q. It split. According to the map, it splits the air
- and goes --- one going to the longwall and the other
- 25 going up to the other sections.

- 1 A. Well, see, at one time, when that longwall was way
- 2 up here, our air come up this way. Let's see.
- 3 Q. All right. Also, based on your description of Mr.
- 4 Hager and Mr. Moore, that you had some confidence in
- 5 them, ---
- 6 A. Absolutely.
- 7 Q. --- had some confidence in them?
- 8 A. Out of all the people I worked with --- I mean,
- 9 not to interrupt you or nothing, but them two right
- there, you know, they're --- they do things right, you
- 11 know what I'm saying, and they both was throwed in on
- this. And you know, Everett didn't want to be there,
- but they brung him over to help straighten this place
- out. And just like I said, you know, he told me it
- took a month, two months to get to know the mines, and
- it will take a couple months to get to know the men,
- 17 you know what I mean, or three months, you know. So
- he didn't really --- in my opinion, he still was just
- 19 trying to get used to this place and he was trying to,
- 20 you know, make changes to make things better, you
- 21 know. He's always been trying to make --- you know,
- do things better and make things better, you know, and
- 23 he's always kept a clean section. I mean, ---.
- Q. Part of our investigation is trying to figure
- 25 out ---

- 1 A. Right.
- 2 Q. --- who was doing what and where.
- 3 A. Right.
- 4 Q. Okay?
- 5 A. Right.
- 6 Q. Now, my understanding is that Mr. Hager was the
- 7 superintendent for the north part of the mine ---
- 8 A. Right.
- 9 Q. --- at the time of the explosion; is that correct?
- 10 Is that the way you recall it?
- 11 A. As far as I understand, yeah.
- 12 Q. Do you know when Mr. Hager because superintendent?
- 13 Had he been working someplace else?
- 14 A. He was at Ellis Eagle or --- yeah, Ellis Eagle.
- 15 Q. Okay. Now, when did Mr. Hager come to UBB?
- 16 A. February maybe. I might be wrong, but January,
- 17 February, March somewhere.
- 18 Q. You're confidential that prior to January and
- 19 February Mr. Hager was someplace other than UBB?
- 20 A. He was at Slip Ridge.
- 21 Q. Okay.
- A. Or no. He was at Ellis Eagle.
- Q. Okay. What about Mr. Moore, had he always been at
- 24 UBB or did he come ---?
- 25 A. He had been there a few months longer, but I think

- 1 he had been our section boss. I think he was over on
- 2 the other side, not on this side. I don't know
- 3 exactly where he was at or where, but ---.
- 4 Q. Now, we understand that Wayne Persinger came to
- 5 UBB sometime in the early part of 2010. Does that
- 6 sound about; ---
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. --- right?
- 9 A. Right.
- 10 Q. Would Mr. Persinger have come about the same time
- 11 as Mr. Hager?
- 12 A. Yeah. I think so. I mean, there might have been
- a couple weeks difference or a month difference, you
- 14 know, but pretty much around the same time.
- 15 O. Okay.
- 16 MS. MONFORTON:
- 17 I just have a couple of follow-up
- 18 questions.
- 19 EXAMINATION
- 20 BY MS. MONFORTON:
- 21 Q. Talking about Mr. Persinger and Mr. Hager coming,
- do you have any idea of what the circumstances were
- 23 that caused the company to put them there at the mine?
- 24 What was going on at the mine that you --- any idea of
- 25 why those individuals were put at the mine?

- 1 A. I think his name was Andy Kolson. I think he was
- 2 the superintendent. And I think they had fired him
- 3 because they let it flood up in there and it caused to
- 4 have another return set, and the longwall was down for
- 5 an additional week or two. And I think that's how it
- 6 come about that --- and then Homer retired. And then
- 7 after, you know, Andy was fired and Homer retired,
- 8 they had to put somebody in their --- you know. And
- 9 they brung the best to make things better, you know.
- 10 I mean, the three men that they brung there, you know,
- 11 Terry Moore and Everett Hager and Persinger, they're
- fine people. I mean, they do things right and they
- get things for you, you know. And all three of them,
- they just had throwed in there, you know, and ---. To
- me it's not really right that, you know, they would
- get hung up on this because none of the three was
- there long enough to know what really was going on at
- this mines, you know.
- 19 Q. Thank you.
- 20 A. You know, you feel like there's 29 men dead, and I
- 21 know because I worked with all them guys, and you feel
- like, you know, that somebody is going to take the
- 23 blame for this, you know. I mean, something happened
- terribly wrong, you know. But I know them three guys
- and I know that they're not going to do nothing in any

- 1 shape or form --- I mean, for instance --- I know this
- is totally off the wall. I remember Everett Hager, we
- were having bad top, and I never seen another mine
- 4 foreman, he'd take everybody on the section for the
- first 20 minutes and pull rock. Mid-shift you shut
- 6 down. Everybody would get a slate bar and pull rock.
- 7 And I've never heard of another mine foreman do
- 8 something like that, you know, looking out for each
- 9 other. And that's the kind of guy he was, you know.
- 10 O. Thanks for sharing that with us. You mentioned a
- 11 number of times that there were a lot of air
- 12 changes ---
- 13 A. Right.
- Q. --- going on at the mine. What were the
- procedures for miners to know that there were going to
- be air changes, or did you just go up to the section
- and it would be something different every day?
- 18 A. Well, as far as the air changes, I mean, they
- 19 would tell you that there was --- you would hear about
- 20 it from your foreman, you know, that there was an air
- change, and hopefully we'd have better air.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. And that's --- you know, ---.
- Q. So it was your experience that the foreman would
- 25 know and they would let you know what to expect?

- 1 A. Yeah. Our foreman would let us know. But you
- 2 know, they made an air change and where they was
- 3 trying to put your return air or something, you didn't
- 4 know that. You'd know that they made a change and
- 5 that was it, you know.
- 6 Q. I'm just going to ask if you can help us with any
- 7 dates or time frames. You mentioned that your
- 8 recollection that for two or three weeks you were down
- 9 on Headgate --- Production was down on Headgate 22 and
- some individuals were building at that same time some
- 11 Kennedy stoppings.
- 12 A. Uh-huh (yes).
- Q. Can you pinpoint an approximate amount of time?
- 14 A. I know we was down for at least two --- I'm
- 15 thinking more closer to three weeks, that they
- 16 wouldn't let us run because we didn't have no return.
- 17 And I can't remember if our return was with the
- longwalls or they was trying to get them to let us
- 19 return our air with the longwall. And we built all
- them Kennedy stoppings. We worked for two or three
- weeks.
- Q. Was that in the fall of last year? Would it have
- been October, November 2009?
- A. I think it would be around January. Don't hold me
- to this, I mean, because I'm really bad on dates, I

- admit, but I'm thinking it was around January and
- 2 February.
- 3 Q. Okay. Did you indicate that on a shift when you
- 4 had good air that you'd expect to get about a hundred
- 5 foot?
- 6 A. Yeah.
- 7 Q. So if we looked at the production books, we'd
- 8 probably see some shifts then when it was 60 or 80?
- 9 A. Most shifts was around 80 to 150, something like
- 10 that. I think the only --- the best shift we ever had
- last year was --- not this year but last year was 4th
- of July. I think we --- after all the deductions and
- everything, it was 350 foot.
- Q. On one shift?
- 15 A. One shift.
- 16 Q. You were running the miner on that shift?
- 17 A. Yes. And I had Bobbie Pauley as a buggy operator
- 18 behind me, the lady.
- 19 Q. Uh-huh (yes).
- 20 A. She was running the buggy, and I think we got 220
- on our side or something like that. That was the best
- shift and probably the only shift that we done that.
- Q. Okay. That's my only question.
- 24 MR. FARLEY:
- 25 Maybe a quick break?

- 1 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 2 All right. Let's go off the record.
- 3 SHORT BREAK TAKEN
- 4 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 5 Back on the record. Erik?
- 6 RE-EXAMINATION
- 7 BY MR. SHERER:
- 8 Q. I got one follow-up question. You mentioned you
- 9 were working in the water back in the headgate of the
- 10 longwall. Did you notice any problems from working in
- 11 the water? Did you get any rashes or anything when
- 12 you were doing that?
- 13 A. I didn't, no.
- Q. Do you know anybody that has?
- 15 A. Not that I can recall, no.
- 16 Q. Okay. Thank you.
- 17 A. I mean, no, not that I can recall.
- 18 O. Thank you.
- 19 MR. FARLEY:
- 20 Anything else?
- 21 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 22 Celeste, anything?
- MS. MONFORTON:
- 24 Nothing.
- 25 ATTORNEY WILSON:

- 1 Nothing? All right. Then Mr. Hulgan, on
- behalf of MSHA and the Office of Miners' health,
- 3 Safety and Training, I want to thank you for appearing
- 4 and answering questions today. Your cooperation is
- 5 very important to the investigation as we work to
- 6 determine the cause of the accident. I'll remind you
- 7 that we request that you not discuss your testimony
- 8 with anyone because we will be interviewing additional
- 9 witnesses. After questioning other witnesses, we may
- 10 call you if we feel that we have any follow-up
- 11 questions that we would like to ask you. And if you
- do think of anything additional that you would like to
- provide to the investigation team, please contact us
- at the contact information that was provided to you.
- 15 Also in the letter that I provided to you there's some
- information concerning your rights as a miner under
- 17 the Mine Act. And to find out additional information
- 18 concerning your rights under the Mine Act, you can go
- to MSHA's website at www.msha.gov.
- 20 Before we finish, I want to give you an
- 21 opportunity. If there's anything else that you would
- like to add to the record or if there's a statement
- 23 that you would like to make, you can do that at this
- 24 time.
- 25 A. The only thing that I'd like to say is, you know,

- that I don't think --- you know, I know they rock
- 2 dusted a lot on the track because that was easy, you
- know, the track machine. You know, a lot of these
- 4 entries --- especially when they got up here to these
- four entries up here and stuff, you know, One, Two and
- 6 Four, you know, was not rock dusted enough.
- 7 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 8 And are you referring to the back side of
- 9 the longwall?
- 10 A. Headgate 21.
- 11 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 12 Okay.
- 13 A. And it's just a lack of rock dust, I think. I
- think it would have helped a lot if they would have
- dusted a whole lot more, you know. And I do have a
- 16 couple pictures, if you'd be interested in looking at
- them, where it was --- it stayed black, I mean, if
- 18 you'd want to look at them.
- 19 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 20 Absolutely. Why don't we go off the
- record and we'll do this, and then we'll come back on
- and finish up. Off the record.
- 23 PICTURES REVIEWED
- 24 RE-EXAMINATION
- 25 BY MS. MONFORTON:

- 1 Q. I'm going to ask you --- since we're talking about
- 2 rock dusting, I'm going to ask you, to the best of
- your recollection, in the couple of weeks before the
- 4 explosion to mark on the map --- whether you circle it
- or however you want to do it, the areas that you felt
- 6 were not adequately rock dusted. I think we --- at
- one point we were off the record and you were talking
- 8 about a lot of float coal dust in this crossover area
- 9 and so on. So just, from your own recollection ---.
- 10 A. Well, off the record, okay.
- 11 O. Yes.
- 12 OFF RECORD DISCUSSION
- 13 (M. Hulgan Exhibits Four through Seven
- marked for identification.)
- 15 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 16 All right. Let's go back on the record.
- 17 While we were off the record we downloaded and printed
- out copies of photographs. Mr. Hulgan, I'm going to
- 19 show you what have been marked as Exhibits Hulgan
- 20 Four, Five, Six and Seven. Are these printouts of the
- 21 photographs that you took?
- 22 A. Yes, they are.
- 23 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 24 All right.
- 25 A. All four of them, yes.

- 1 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 2 And ---.
- 3 A. They come off my phone.
- 4 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 5 And can you take the blue marker and ---
- 6 these were taken on the longwall headgate panel; is
- 7 that correct?
- 8 A. Right.
- 9 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 10 Back towards the Bandytown fan?
- 11 A. Right.
- 12 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 13 And can you take --- I know you don't
- remember the specific crosscut, but would you be able
- to just circle the general area where you think these
- 16 photographs were taken?
- 17 A. Yeah, I can try.
- 18 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 19 All right. So with the blue marker
- 20 please do that.
- 21 WITNESS COMPLIES
- 22 A. You can't see the date on that, but 3/15 and that
- one there is --- I'm going to say --- should I just
- 24 circle the area?
- 25 ATTORNEY WILSON:

- 1 Yeah.
- 2 A. I'm going to say in this area right here.
- 3 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 4 Okay. And you circled that in blue?
- 5 A. Right.
- 6 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 7 And that would have been before September
- 8 of 2009; is that right?
- 9 A. Right.
- 10 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 11 All right. Celeste, did you have a
- 12 follow-up question?
- 13 MS. MONFORTON:
- 14 Yeah.
- 15 RE-EXAMINATION
- 16 BY MS. MONFORTON:
- Q. You indicated when we were off the record that you
- took the photographs of the mining machine.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. But what was your --- what did you notice in
- 21 particular looking back at those photographs about the
- 22 condition of the area you were working in?
- 23 A. Actually, I really never really paid that much
- 24 attention to them pictures until after the explosion.
- 25 And then after I really got looking at them, I noticed

- that there was no rock dust. I mean, there's I think
- 2 a picture of a bolter and a miner there and there was
- 3 --- you know, there's no --- nothing has been rock
- 4 dusted. Everything's just black as it can be.
- 5 Q. And how does that relate to your experience in
- 6 terms of rock dusting at this mine over the last year?
- 7 A. You know, there was very little rock dusting done.
- 8 And I think I've counted five times on my hand --- I
- 9 mean, five times that it's been rock dusted ---
- 10 machine dusted that I know of on our shift.
- 11 Q. In the two or three weeks preceding the explosion,
- what's your recollection of the rock dusting in the
- 13 sections where you traveled or worked?
- 14 A. On Headgate 22, the whole time that --- from the
- mouth of the section to where it stopped mining, I
- 16 know that it was machine dusted two times, that Terry
- Moore filled in for another boss and he definitely
- 18 made sure that it was rock dusted twice, the two ships
- 19 that he was up there.
- 20 Q. And when Mr. Moore was making sure that it was
- 21 rock dusted on Headgate 22, what areas would he have
- 22 rock dusted --- or would have had rock dusted?
- 23 A. Again, you know, that could --- you know, you
- 24 could probably just go back in the records and see
- 25 where he filled in for somebody. That would be the

- best thing I could tell you.
- Q. Okay.
- 3 A. There was two shifts that he had to sign the books
- 4 where he filled in for somebody.
- 5 Q. What was your recollection of this area that we've
- 6 been calling the crossover in terms of adequacy of
- 7 rock dusting?
- 8 A. A lot of float dust between --- I don't know what
- 9 you would call this here and this.
- 10 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 11 Well, between the 22 Tailgate and 22
- 12 Headgate.
- 13 A. Right. There was a lot of float dust.
- 14 BY MS. MONFORTON:
- Q. Would you mark in pink on the map the area that
- 16 you believe was not adequately rock dusted in the
- 17 couple of weeks preceding the explosion?
- 18 WITNESS COMPLIES
- 19 BY MS. MONFORTON:
- 20 Q. And in those couple of weeks preceding the
- 21 explosion, you would have been traveling up this North
- 22 Glory mains area?
- 23 A. Right.
- Q. And what's your recollection of rock dusting in
- 25 that area?

- 1 A. Well, now, you know, the track part that we rode
- 2 --- you know, the mantrip that we rode, looked decent.
- 3 It really did. That part of the mines from probably
- 4 Headgate 22 --- at the head of the Headgate 22 to the
- 5 outside looked good.
- 6 Q. On the track entry?
- 7 A. The track entry. From Headgate 22 to the face was
- 8 in bad shape for rock dust, along with Headgate 21,
- 9 all the way from the --- from March, where the
- 10 longwall left off, all the way up to the --- where the
- 11 fan was, the new fan they put in.
- 12 Q. Thank you, sir.
- 13 MS. MONFORTON:
- 14 Any other questions?
- 15 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 16 Terry?
- 17 RE-EXAMINATION
- 18 BY MS. FARLEY:
- 19 Q. When you mined coal on Headgate 22, did you run
- 20 the scrubber on the miner at any time?
- 21 A. Yeah.
- 22 Q. How often did you do it?
- 23 A. Every cut. It depended on the scrubber pretty
- 24 much.
- 25 Q. Okay.

- 1 A. It wasn't the best scrubber in the world, but it
- would draw the dust. You depended on the scrubber.
- 3 Q. So you ran it every day?
- 4 A. Yeah, every day. Every cut.
- 5 Q. What about --- well, I know you didn't work on the
- 6 other miner section at Tailgate 22 when they did.
- 7 A. I didn't what now?
- 8 Q. What about the other section, 22 Tailgate? Would
- 9 they have run the scrubber?
- 10 A. You're talking about here?
- 11 Q. Yes, sir.
- 12 A. Okay. I think they had 1415s there, and I really
- don't know --- I mean, I been by this, you know, a
- thousand times, but when they started this section
- off, I was no part of it.
- 16 Q. Okay.
- 17 A. I was, you know, pretty much up in here then, up
- on Headqate 22.
- 19 Q. Okay.
- 20 A. And when they started Headqate 21, I wasn't there
- when they brung the equipment in and I wasn't there
- when they mined any of it.
- 23 Q. Last year, when you were down there towards
- 24 Bandytown, in the area that you marked earlier, did
- 25 you run the scrubber in that area, too?

- 1 A. Yeah.
- 2 Q. Was that an everyday thing?
- 3 A. Yeah.
- 4 Q. Okay. All right.
- 5 A. Oh, yeah.
- 6 Q. Okay. Thank you.
- 7 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 8 Anything further? Erik, anything?
- 9 MR. SHERER:
- 10 No.
- 11 ATTORNEY WILSON:
- 12 All right. Then Mr. Hulgan, again I want
- to thank you for coming in today. And if there's
- anything else, please contact us. And if there's
- nothing further, then we'll go off the record. Thank
- 16 you.
- 17 A. Thank you all.
- 19 STATEMENT UNDER OATH CONCLUDED AT 3:11 P.M.
- 20 \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \*
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

Page 82 1 STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA ) 2 3 4 CERTIFICATE 5 I, Alicia R. Brant, a Notary Public in and for the State of West Virginia, do hereby certify: 6 7 That the witness whose testimony appears in the foregoing deposition, was duly sworn by me on said 8 date and that the transcribed deposition of said 9 witness is a true record of the testimony given by 10 11 said witness; 12 That the proceeding is herein recorded fully and accurately; 13 14 That I am neither attorney nor counsel for, 15 nor related to any of the parties to the action in which these depositions were taken, and further that I 16 17 am not a relative of any attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto, or financially interested in 18 this action. 19 20 21 22 Alicia R. Brant 23 24

25